



**District of  
North Saanich**

***STAFF REPORT***

To: Tim Tanton  
Chief Administrative Officer

Date: May 6, 2020

From: Eymond Toupin  
Director of Infrastructure Services

Re: **Procurement of Engineering Services – 2021 Water Main Renewal Project**

---

**RECOMMENDATION:**

That Council approve award of engineering services for the 2021 Water Main Renewal Project to Colquitz Engineering Ltd. for the proposed fee of \$117,835 (exclusive of GST).

**STRATEGIC PLAN IMPLICATIONS:**

This matter relates to the following Council strategic priorities:

***Protect and Enhance Rural, Agricultural, Heritage, Marine and Environmental Resources***

***Maintain a Safe and Healthy Community***

***Ensure Strong Leadership, Fiscal Responsibility and Transparent Government***

**INTRODUCTION / BACKGROUND:**

In the 2016 Water Master Plan, which forms part of the District's asset management plan, water main replacement and upgrades were identified in a number of areas in the District. Replacement of undersized and older asbestos cement (AC) mains installed in the 1960s were identified as the highest priorities as these were approaching the end of their useful life and were also deficient in their ability to deliver fire flows.

The first priority, which will be completed in 2020, was the replacement of 3.5 km of 100mm (4") diameter AC mains on Lands End and Chalet Road. The next high priority watermain replacement is for Curteis Point where approximately 1.2 km of 100mm (4") main is to be replaced on Curteis, Dunne, Kedge Anchor and Inwood. The construction of these works is planned for 2021.

In accordance with the District's Purchasing Policy, staff developed and issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) to procure engineering services for the design and contract administration of the 2021 Water Main Renewal Project which was posted on BC Bids. The RFP closed on Friday, April 17<sup>th</sup> and proposals were received from twelve firms as summarized in Table 1.

**Table 1: Summary of Proposals Received for Engineering Services for the 2021 WM Renewal Project**

Proponent	Total Score 100%	Total Proposed Fee (Excluding GST)	Qualifications and Experience 25%	Methodology 30%	Proposal 15%	Budget 30%	Contract Admin (hrs) (Min 120)	Field Inspection (hrs) (Min 480)
Colquitz Engineering	85.5	\$117,835.00	25	30	15	15.5	120	480
McElhanney Consulting Services Ltd.	84.8	\$123,426.40	25	30	15	14.8	126	480
Parsons Inc.	81.7	\$156,612.00	25	30	15	11.7	120	480
Associated Engineering (B.C.) Ltd.	79.5	\$173,662.00	24	30	15	10.5	124	480
MSR Solutions Inc.	73.7	\$88,540.00	20	20	13	20.7	132	480
ISL Engineering and Land Services Ltd.	83.5	\$61,995.00	24	15	15	29.5	120	120*
Westbrook Consulting Ltd.	79.0	\$73,305.00	24	15	15	25	100*	200*
Gwaii Engineering Ltd.	78.0	\$60,995.30	20	15	13	30	70*	128*
Stantec Consulting Ltd.	77.0	\$79,472.88	25	15	14	23	120	262*
On Point Project Engineers Ltd.	73.3	\$90,180.00	23	15	15	20.3	40*	152*
WSP Canada Group Ltd.	73.1	\$82,811.00	22	15	14	22.1	80*	480
Kerr Wood Leidal Associates Ltd.	68.3	\$137,600.00	25	15	15	13.3	70*	450*

The proposals were evaluated using the following criteria and weightings.

- 1) Qualifications and Experience 25%
- 2) Methodology 30%
- 3) Proposal 15%
- 4) Fees 30%

The Terms of Reference for the RFP included requirements for the budgeted fees to include a minimum of half time inspection during an assumed construction period of 120 working days representing a minimum of 480 hours plus a minimum of 5 hours per week of contract administration for a total of 120 hours. Only 5 of the proposals met this requirement, Colquitz Engineering Ltd., McElhanney Consulting Services Ltd., Parsons Inc., Associated Engineering (B.C.) Ltd., and MSR Solutions Inc. As a consequence of not complying with either of these requirements, the methodology score for the remaining 7 proposals was set to 15 of 30 and these proposals disqualified and marked with an asterisk.

#### 1) Qualifications and Experience:

Of the qualified proposals, the Colquitz, McElhanney, and Parsons teams were rated highest in terms of qualifications and experience. Their proposals demonstrated good corporate experience and the proposed project manager, designer, and inspector for each of these teams had good experience on relevant projects.



2) Methodology:

Of the qualified proposals, the submissions from Colquitz, McElhanney, Parsons and Associated Engineering teams were rated highest in terms of methodology being detailed, comprehensive, and appropriate and having a very good understanding of the project.

3) Proposal:

All the proposals were complete but the proposals from Colquitz, McElhanney, Parsons and Associated Engineering were higher in detail and quality.

4) Fees:

The difference in the fee proposals largely reflect different levels of effort anticipated and proposed as the rates for the team members are comparable for all proponents. The lowest fee from the qualified proposals was from MSR Solutions and reflects the lowest number of hours for the assignment. Staff's assessment of the MSR Solutions work plan indicates the level of effort was underestimated and would not result in the successful delivery of the services required. The MSR Solutions qualifications and experience, methodology, and proposal were rated the lowest of the five qualified submissions received.

5) Overall

The proposal from Colquitz Engineering met the requirements outlined in the Request for Proposals, scored the highest in the evaluation process, and was the second lowest costing qualified proposal. Staff therefore recommend award to Colquitz Engineering.

The District's Purchasing Policy requires Council approval to award contracts with a value exceeding \$100,000.

**FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:**

The watermain renewal program is funded from the District's Water Infrastructure Replacement Reserve from which an average of \$500,000 is planned to be expended annually. The anticipated balance in this reserve at the end of 2020 is approximately \$2.7 million.

A grant application was submitted to the Investing in Canada Infrastructure Program (ICIP) Green Infrastructure – Environmental Quality Sub-stream offered by the governments of BC and Canada for this project in February, 2020. The program provides funding up to 40% from the Government of Canada and up to 33.33% from the Province of BC for a total of up to 73.33%. By committing \$400,000 in funding, if successful with the application, the District could leverage nearly \$1.1 million in grant funds. Staff have not yet been advised of the outcome of the grant application. The watermain renewal project at Curteis Point has a preliminary estimated total project cost of \$1.5 million. The majority of these costs would be expended in 2021 when the watermain is planned to be constructed.

The proposal from Colquitz Engineering received the highest score in the evaluation process and has a cost of \$117,835 (exclusive of GST). The proposed fees are commensurate with the scope of work associated with this project. Sufficient funds are available from the reserve to fund these services.

**CONCLUSION:**

The annual renewal of watermain infrastructure is part of an on-going program in the District. The next high priority watermain replacement is for Curteis Point where approximately 1.2 km of 100mm (4") main is to be replaced on Curteis, Dunne, Kedge Anchor and Inwood. The watermain renewal project at Curteis Point has a preliminary estimated total project cost of \$1.5 million and the majority of these costs would be expended in 2021 when the watermain is planned to be constructed.

Staff issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) to procure engineering services for design and contract administration and proposals were received from 12 firms. The proposal from Colquitz Engineering Ltd. received the highest evaluation score and had a proposed fee of \$117,835 (exclusive of GST). Sufficient funds are available in the District's Water Infrastructure Replacement Reserve to accommodate this budget. Staff respectfully submit the following recommendation:

**RECOMMENDATION:**

That Council approve award of engineering services for the 2021 Water Main Renewal Project to Colquitz Engineering Ltd. for the proposed fee of \$117,835 (exclusive of GST).

Respectfully submitted,

Concurrence:

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Eymond Toupin  
Director of Infrastructure Services

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Tim Tanton  
Chief Administrative Officer

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Stephanie Munro  
Director of Financial Services